

Political Heterogeneity and “Constitutio Libertatis”

Alexey Glukhov

Assistant Professor, National Research University Higher School of Economics

20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000

Email: agloukhov@hse.ru

The paper deals with the conditions of the possible renewal of the “Constitutio libertatis” project on the basis of the 20th-century experience. The global political conflict, resulted in severe intellectual confrontation, produced the split of philosophy into two isolated movements: the “continental” and the “analytical” movements, each promoting its own logic of thinking. The paper shows the influence of this fundamental philosophical schism on the key versions of the contemporary political philosophy. A new formulation for the main political problem emerges pointing to the mutual untranslatability of the languages of freedom and of justice. The two languages are traceable to the two competing philosophical logics, those of difference and of representation. The notion of “form of life” (“Lebensform”), used politically by Plato and analyzed logically by Wittgenstein in his *Philosophical Investigations*, is introduced as a conceptual basis for a new political theory that should solve the main political problem. Finally, some basic propositions are discussed, that should be observed in trying to resume the project of the “Constitutio libertatis”. It is shown that the negative definition of the concept of freedom must be abandoned. Freedom has a certain logical form, but it does not logically imply that various forms of life, with their liberties expressed through various logical forms, inevitably come into mutual conflict. The foundation of the “Constitutio libertatis” is based on the autonomous “forms of life” and is justly distributed throughout a complex non-Cartesian texture of political reality.

Keywords: freedom, liberalism, representation, constitution, justice, communitarianism, political logic, difference

References

- Ankersmit F.R. (2011) *Politicheskaja reprezentacija* [Political Representation], Moscow: HSE.
- Arendt H. (1990) Philosophy and politics. *Social Research*, vol. 57, no 1, pp. 73–103.
- Arendt H. (2011) *O revoljucii* [On Revolution], Moscow: Evropa.
- Deleuze G. (1962) *Nietzsche et la Philosophie*, Paris: PUF.
- Deleuze G., Guattari F. (1980) *Mille plateaux*, Paris: Minuit.
- Foucault M. (2011) *The Courage of the Truth (The Government of Self and Others II): Lectures at the College de France, 1983–1984*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Heidegger M. (1993) *Iskusstvo i prostranstvo* [Art and Space]. *Vremja i bytie* [Time and Being], Moscow: Respublika, pp. 312–316.
- Kant I. (1994) *K vechnomu miru* [Perpetual Peace]. *Sochinenija v 4-h tt. na nemeckom i russkom jazykah. T. 1: Traktaty i stat'i (1784–1796)* [Collected Works in Russian and German, vol. 1: Treatises and Articles (1784–1796)], Moscow: Kami, pp. 353–477.
- Laslett P. (1956) Introduction. *Philosophy, Politics and Society* (ed. P. Laslett), Oxford: Blackwell, 1956, pp. vii–xv.
- Chomsky N., Foucault M. (2006) *The Chomsky–Foucault Debate: On Human Nature*, New York: New Press.
- Rawls J. (1996) *Political Liberalism*, New York: Columbia University Press.
- Rorty R. (1999) Postmodernistskij burzhuaznyj liberalizm [Postmodernist Bourgeois Liberalism]. *Logos*, no 9, pp. 96–104.

Sandel M.J. (2009) *Justice: What's the Right Thing to Do?*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Taylor Ch. (1985) *Philosophy and the Human Sciences*, New York: Cambridge University Press.

Walzer M. (1983) *Spheres of Justice: A Defense of Pluralism and Equality*, New York: Basic Books.

Young I.M. (1990) *Justice and the Politics of Difference*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Zizek S. (2009) *In Defense of Lost Causes*, London: Verso.

Two Concepts of Rules

John Rawls

Andrei Korbut
(translator)

Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000
Email: korbut.andrei@gmail.com

In his famous paper John Rawls outlines a version of utilitarianism that takes into account the existing criticism of the utilitarian approach. Author shows that the traditional objections expressed in relation to two test cases of utilitarianism — punishment and promise-keeping — are based on the misunderstanding of utilitarian position, because they don't make a distinction between justifying a practice and justifying a particular action falling under it. In the case of punishment, there two justifications of it: the retributive view that presupposes that punishment is justified on the grounds that wrongdoing merits punishment, and the utilitarian view that holds that punishment is justifiable only by reference to the probable consequences of maintaining it as one of the devices of the social order. According to the author, utilitarian arguments are appropriate with regard to questions about practices, while retributive arguments fit the application of particular rules to particular cases. In the case of promising, truly utilitarian approach presupposes that promisor must weigh not only the effects of breaking his/her promise on the particular case, but also the effect which his/her breaking promise will have on the practice itself. Author thinks that the distinction between justifying a practice and justifying a particular action falling under it was neglected not only by the critics, but by the utilitarians themselves, due to the prevalence of the summary view of the rules. Rawls suggests his own, practical conception of the rules, that presupposes that practices are prior to particular cases of their application.

Keywords: action, utilitarianism, punishment, promise, rules, practice

References

- Aiken H.D. (1952) The levels of moral discourse. *Ethics*, vol. 62, no 4, pp. 235–248.
- Austin J. (1873) *Lectures on Jurisprudence*, London: John Murray.
- Bentham J. (1830) *The Rationale of Punishment*, London: Heward.
- Bentham J. (1945) *The Limits of Jurisprudence Defined*, New York: Columbia University Press.
- Carritt E.F. (1947) *Ethical and Political Thinking*, Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Hume D. (1996) Traktat o chelovecheskoj prirode, ili Popytka primenit' osnovannyj na opyte metod rassuzhdenija k moral'nym predmetam [A Treatise of Human Nature, Being an Attempt to introduce the experimental Method of Reasoning into Moral Subjects]. *Sochinenija, T. 1* [Works, Vol. 1], Moscow: Mysl, pp. 53–655.
- Mabbott J.D. (1939) Punishment. *Mind (New Series)*, vol. 48, no 190, pp. 152–167.
- Melden A.I. (1951) Two comments on utilitarianism. *Philosophical Review*, vol. 60, no 4, pp. 508–524.
- Mill J.S. (1864) *Utilitarianism*, London: Longman.
- Mill J.S. (1872) *A System of Logic*, London: Longmans, Green, Reader, and Dyer.
- Mill J.S. (2007) Ob opredelenii predmeta politicheskoj jekonomii; i o metode issledovanija, svojstvennom ej [On the Definition of Political Economy and on the Method of

- Investigation Proper to It]. *Osnovy politicheskoj jekonomii s nekotorymi prilozhenijami k social'noj filosofii* [The Principles of Political Economy with Some of Their Applications to Social Philosophy], Moscow: Eksmo, pp. 987–1023.
- Moore J. (1984) *Principy jetiki* [Principia Ethica], Moscow: Progress.
- Nowell-Smith P.H. (1954) *Ethics*, London: Penguin.
- Pickard-Cambridge W.A. (1932) Two problems about duty (II). *Mind (New Series)*, vol. 41, no 162, pp. 145–172.
- Quinton A.M. (1954) On punishment. *Analysis*, vol. 14, no 6, pp. 133–142.
- Radzinowicz L. (1948) *A History of English Criminal Law and Its Administration from 1750: The Movement for Reform, 1750–1833*, London: Macmillan.
- Rawls J. (1951) Outline of a decision procedure for ethics. *Philosophical Review*, vol. 60, no 2, pp. 177–197.
- Rawls J. (1951) “An examination of the place of reason in ethics” by Stephen Edelston Toulmin. *Philosophical Review*, vol. 60, no 4, pp. 572–580.
- Robbins L. (1952) *The Theory of Economic Policy in English Classical Political Economy*, London: Macmillan.
- Ross D. (1930) *The Right and the Good*, Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Ross D. (1939) *Foundations of Ethics*, Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Sidgwick H. (1901) *The Methods of Ethics*, London: Macmillan.
- Toulmin S.E. (1950) *An Examination of the Place of Reason in Ethics*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Urmson J.O. (1953) The interpretation of the moral philosophy of J.S. Mill. *Philosophical Quarterly*, vol. 3, no 10, pp. 33–39.
- Wittgenstein L. (1994) *Filosofskie issledovanija* [Philosophical Investigations]. *Filosofskie raboty, Ch. 1* [Philosophical Works, Part 1], Moscow: Gnozis, pp. 75–319.

Toward a Historical Situation of Police in Russia

Alexander Filippov

Professor of Sociology, National Research University Higher School of Economics

20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000

E-mail: filippovaf@gmail.com

A Dialogue of Oleg Kildyushov and Zinaida Peregudova

Oleg Kildyushov

Leading Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000
Email: kildyushov@mail.ru

Zinaida Peregudova

Lead Specialist, State Archive of Russian Federation
17 Bolshaya Pirogovskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 119435
E-mail: peregood1@rambler.ru

Olga Kononova

Lecturer, Moscow State University
Leninskie Gory, GSP-1, Moscow, Russian Federation 119991
E-mail: olgakononova@yandex.ru

The dialogue discloses the history and present condition of contemporary police researches which are the part of a specific discipline — policing studies in the broad sense. Drawing on the case of history of political security service interview provides a reconstruction of police studies history in the USSR and contemporary Russia. Specific attention is paid to the present condition of historiography on that topic. Even prominent scholars of that problem do not understand structure and real mechanics of law enforcement and state security activities in Russian Empire. Special attention is paid to organizing and functioning of Police Department — the chief agency of Internal Affairs Ministry and its interaction with other law enforcement bodies: general police, gendarmerie, etc. Dialogue discusses structural, ideological and personal aspects of law enforcement and state security activities in Russian Empire. The case of training for future policemen and state security agents is also being discussed against particular examples of how foremost Western police techniques influenced Russian police as well as attempts to reform it. The dialogue pays a lot of attention to Russian police reformation projects in the beginning of 20th century, especially to those prepared by count Ignatiev and Senator Makarov commission which acted within the so called “Special Deliberation Committee”. Interview compares these reformation projects with current attempts to reform contemporary law machinery of Russian Federation. Conversation is being concluded by discussing how perception of police by Russian society in general could be changed in some more positive way.

Keywords: Police Department, Zubatov, Senator Makarov’ Commission, Special Corps of gendarmes, ohranka, police socialism, Ministry of Internal Affairs reform

Glossarium

Carl Schmitt

Yuri Korinets
(translator)

Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000
E-mail: korinetz7@mail.ru

Carl Schmitt kept diaries throughout his life, several of which he specifically selected for academic publication. These are the recordings made in the early years after World War II, when Schmitt lost all his positions. After his release from the prison he returned to his home in small town of Plettenberg, where he remained until his death. Schmitt ordered these diaries to be published only after his death, because, even several decades after the war, they remained ideologically dangerous. In this issue we continue to publish fragments of translation of the “Glossarium”. In the fragments prepared for present publication, Schmitt argues on several important topics. First, he writes about utopia — paradise located in a remote, but achievable future. The ability to think future located at long distance decreases in modern times. Therefore, in the 19th century they have to move from utopia to positive science. Those who write on future must say that heaven can come tomorrow. Schmitt goes further to compare the utopian ideas of Thomas More with the utopias of the 19th century. More was not a cleric; he was just a clerk, an intellectual, a writer, not a priest. Schmitt questioned the rightfulness of the canonization of More and compared him with another Catholic thinker of that time, Fr. Vitoria. Another important topic — the problem of legality and legitimacy. Schmitt once again handles it in connection with the events in Czechoslovakia in 1948. These events he contrasts with the situation in Germany in 1929-1932.

Keywords: Heidegger, Hobbes, utopia, Francis Bacon, Thomas More, William Shakespeare, “das Man”

The “Ladies’ Circle” of Slavophilism: The Letters of I.S. Aksakov to Countess M.F. Sollogub, 1862–1878

Andrey Teslya

Assistant Professor, Pacific National University
136 Tihookeanskaya Str., Khabarovsk, Russian Federation 680035
Email: mestr81@gmail.com

In this publication we present the letters of I.S. Aksakov to Countess M.F. Sollogub dated from 1862 to 1878. These letters are of interest not only due to their contents, but also as a sample of correspondence between Aksakov and Slavophile “ladies’ circle”, whose role in the history of Slavophilism is neglected by researchers. The publication is designed to fill this lacuna. Slavophilism were based not only on ideological proximity, but on kindred relationships, neighbourhood, etc. Obviously, the role of “female” party in this context is considerable. Often the chain of relationships is built around female figures. For example, Aksakov’s awareness of the plans of supreme government was partly connected with the position of his wife and her sisters, because all of them were or remained maids of honor of the imperial court. This is still a situation of “old-style politics” when the center of decision-making is a court. It is the orientation to this type of politics that partly explains the reasons for the decline of “political Slavophilism” in the 1880s. Since the time of Nikolay I decisions were developed and accepted more increasingly within bureaucratic machinery. Aksakov’s model of political influence was oriented mainly toward influencing the court, but when role of “court politics” was weakened, Aksakov lost the real possibility to influence policy. Correspondence between Aksakov and Countess Sollogub shows one aspect of this implicit part of the Slavophile activity.

Keywords: public opinion, Slavophilism, Aksakov, Sollogub, informal influence, panslavism

References

- Aksakov I. (1886) *Sochinenija, T. 1* [Works, Vol. 1], Moscow: Tipografija M.G. Volchaninova.
- Aksakov I. (1896) *Ivan Sergeevich Aksakov v ego pis'mah, Ch. 2, T. 4* [The Correspondence of Ivan Sergeevich Aksakov, Part 2, Vol. 4], Saint-Petersburg: Imperatorskaja publichnaja biblioteka.
- Aksakov I. (1988) *Pis'ma k rodnym, 1844–1849* [Letters to the Family, 1844–1849], Moscow: Nauka.
- Aksakov I., Lamansky V. (1916) *Perepiska dvuh slavjanofilov* [A Correspondence of Two Slavophiles]. *Russkaja mysl*, vol. 37, no 9, pp. 1–32.
- Aksakov I., Lamansky V. (1916) *Perepiska dvuh slavjanofilov* [A Correspondence of Two Slavophiles]. *Russkaja mysl*, vol. 37, no 12, pp. 85–114.
- Aksakov I., Lamansky V. (1917) *Perepiska dvuh slavjanofilov* [A Correspondence of Two Slavophiles]. *Russkaja mysl*, vol. 38, no 3-4, pp. 56–70.
- Chicherin B. (2010) *Vospominanija, T. 1* [Memoirs, Vol. 1], Moscow: Izdatelstvo im. Sabashnikovyh.
- Emelyanov E., Teslya A. (2012) “Edinstvennyj golos, k kotoromu prislushivaetsja pravitel'stvo” [“The Only Voice that Government Gives Ear to”]. *Sociologicheskoe obozrenie*, vol. 11, no 3, pp. 45–59.
- Kolyupanov N. (1892) *Biografija Aleksandra Ivanovicha Kosheleva, T. 2* [Biography of Aleksandr Ivanovich Koshelev], Moscow: I.N. Kushnerev i Ko.

- Koshelev A. (2002) *Zapiski Aleksandra Ivanovicha Kosheleva (1812–1883 gody)* [Reminiscences of Aleksandr Ivanovich Koshelev (1812–1883)], Moscow: Nauka.
- Motin S. (ed.) (2012) *Aksakov Ivan Sergeevich: materialy dlja letopisi zhizni i tvorcestva*, Vyp. 4, Ch. 1 [Ivan Sergeevich Aksakov: Materials for the Chronicle of Life and Work, Issue 4, Part 1], Ufa: UYI MVD Rossii.
- Motin S. (ed.) (2013) *Aksakov Ivan Sergeevich: materialy dlja letopisi zhizni i tvorcestva*, Vyp. 4, Ch. 2 [Ivan Sergeevich Aksakov: Materials for the Chronicle of Life and Work, Issue 4, Part 2], Ufa: UYI MVD Rossii.
- Samarin Y. (1877) *Sochinenija*, T. 1 [Works, Vol. 1], Moscow: Tipografija A.I. Mamontova.
- Samarin Y. (1878) *Sochinenija*, T. 2 [Works, Vol. 2], Moscow: Tipografija A.I. Mamontova.
- Samarin Y. (1889) *Sochinenija*, T. 7 [Works, Vol. 7], Moscow: Tipografija A.I. Mamontova.
- Samarin Y., Raden E.F. von (1893) *Perepiska Ju. F. Samarina s baronessoj E.F. von Raden* [A Correspondence of Y. Samarin and Baroness E.F. von Raden], Moscow: Tipografija A.I. Mamontova.
- Teslya A. (2012) Slavjanofil'stvo skvoz' prizmu neformal'nyh otnoshenij [Slavophilism through the Lens of Nonformal Relations]. *Hristianstvo i russkaja literatura*, Vyp. 7 [Christianity and Russian Literature, Issue 7], Saint-Petersburg: Nauka, pp. 46–54.
- Teslya A. (2013) Herzen i slavjanofily [Herzen and Slavophiles]. *Sociologicheskoe obozrenie*, vol. 12, no 1, pp. 62–85.
- Tutcheva A. (2008) *Vospominanija: pri dvore dvuh imperatorov* [Memoirs: At Court of Two Emperors], Moscow: Zakharov.
- Tsimbaev N. (1986) *Slavjanofil'stvo: iz istorii russkoj obshhestvenno-politicheskoj mysli XIX veka* [Slavophilism: From the History of Russian Social-Political Thought of the 19th Century], Moscow: MGU.

Transnational and Gender Paradigms in the Study of International Mobility: The Case of Ukraine

Alisa Tolstokorova

Expert, International School of Equal Opportunities
23 Volgogradskaja Str., app. 32, Kyiv, Ukrain 03141
E-mail: alictol@yahoo.com

The paper is aimed at the analysis of the latest approaches to research in the social sciences including mobility paradigm, the transnational perspective and the gendered approach to the study of social phenomena. The research problem addressed in the paper is the possibility of examining these innovative approaches to social phenomena in a dialectical nexus. The paper draws from the analysis of secondary theoretical sources backed up by the findings of a multi-cited field research focused on the study of gendered implications of Ukrainian labour migration using a mixed-method approach. The paper illustrates the possibilities of applying the transnational paradigm to migration and mobilities studies, placing special emphasis on its advantages. It traces existing approaches to the research on transnational family and cross-border parenthood, using the Ukraine as the case in point. The heuristic and social relevance of the paper consists in casting light on the specificities of gendered approach to the study of economic mobility and labour migration in Ukraine, in outlining the effect of migration and transnationalism on families of Ukrainian transmigrants, in showcasing the specificity of independent female migration in the context of global care chains, and in examining its gender effect on the transformations of mentality and identities of Ukrainian labour migrants.

Keywords: international mobility and migration, transnational paradigm, gendered approach to mobility studies, Ukrainian labour migration

References

- Abashin S. (2012) Sredneaziatskaja migracija: praktiki, lokal'nye soobshhestva, transnacionalizm [Central Asian Migration: Practices, Local Communities, Transnationalism]. *Etnograficheskoe obozrenie*, no 4, pp. 3–13.
- Ajupova Sh. (2012) Uzbekskaja trudovaja migracija iz juzhnoj Kirgizii v Rossiju i ejo vlijanie na gendernye otnoshenija [Uzbek Labour Migration from Southern Kirghizia to Russia and Its Effect on Gender Relations]. *Diaspory*, no 2, pp. 61–85.
- Ally Sh. (2005) Caring about Care Workers: Organising in the Female Shadow of Globalisation (unpublished). Available at: <http://www.globaljusticecenter.org/wp-content/labor1.pdf> (accessed 3 April 2007).
- Amelina A., Faist Th. (2012) De-naturalizing the National in Research Methodologies: Key Concepts of Transnational Studies in Migration. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, vol. 35, no 10, pp. 1707–1724.
- Andall J. (2000) *Gender, Migration and Domestic Service: The Politics of Black Women in Italy*, Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Anderson B. (1991) *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, London: Verso.
- Baldassar L., Baldock C., Wilding R. (2007) *Aged Care Across Borders: Transnational Migration, Families and Long-Distance Care*, London: Palgrave MacMillan.

- Barker J. (2007) *Paradigmy myshlenija: kak uvidet' novoe i preuspet' v menjajushhemsja mire* [Paradigms: The Business of Discovering the Future], Moscow: Alpina Business Books.
- Bauman Z. (2000) *Liquid Modernity*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bauman Z. (2005) *Liquid Life*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bergmann S., Sager T. (2008) *The Ethics of Mobilities: Rethinking Place, Exclusion, Freedom and Environment*, London: Ashgate.
- GAATW (2010) *Beyond Borders: Exploring Links between Trafficking and Gender*. Working Paper, Bangkok: Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women.
- Blok A. (2010) Mapping the Super-whale: Towards a Mobile Ethnography of Situated Globalities. *Mobilities*, vol. 5, no 4, pp. 507–528.
- Brednikova O., Tkach O. (2010) Dom dlja nomady [What Home Means to the Nomad]. *Laboratorium*, no 3, pp. 72–95.
- Bourdieu P. (1998) Struktura, gabbitus, praktika [Structure, Habitus, Practice]. *Zhurnal sociologii i social'noj antropologii*, vol. 1, no 2, pp. 40–58.
- Burhanova F., Valiahmetov R., Khilazheva G. (eds.) (2010) *Sem'ja i chelovecheskoe razvitie v Respublike Bashkortostan* [Family and Human Development in the Republic of Bashkortostan], Ufa: Vostochnaja pechat'.
- Calgar A. (2001) Constraining Metaphors and the Transnationalisation of Spaces in Berlin. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, vol. 27, no 4, pp. 601–613.
- Carling J., Menjivar C., Schmalzbauer L. (2012) Central Themes in the Study of Transnational Parenthood. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, vol. 38, no 2, pp. 191–217.
- Castles S., Miller M. J. (2003) *The Age of Migration*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Cresswell T. (2010) Towards a Politics of Mobility. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, vol. 28, no 1, pp. 17–31.
- D'Andrea A., Ciolfi L., Gray B. (2011) Methodological Challenges and Innovations in Mobilities Research. *Mobilities*, vol. 6, no 2, pp. 149–160.
- Deneva N. (2012) Transnational Aging Carers: On Transformation of Kinship and Citizenship in the Context of Migration among Bulgarian Muslims in Spain. *Social Politics*, vol. 19, no 1, pp. 105–128.
- Ehrenreich B., Hochschild A.R. (2002) *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy*, London: Granta Books.
- European Parliament (2006) *Report on Women's Immigration: The Role and Place of Immigrant Women in the European Union*. Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality.
- Fargues Ph. (2006) *The Demographic Benefit of International Migration: Hypothesis and Application to Middle Eastern and North African contexts*. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 4050, Washington: World Bank.
- Fialkova L. (2005) Opyt adaptacii v ustnyh rasskazah "russkih" izrail'tjanok [Narratives of Experiences of Adaptation Amongst Female "Russian" Immigrants to Israel]. *Diaspory*, no 1, pp. 19–47.
- Folbre N. (1995) Holding Hands at Midnight: The Paradox of Caring Labor. *Feminist Economics*, vol. 1, no 1, pp. 73–92.
- Fouron G., Glick Schiller N. (2001) All in the Family: Gender, Transnational Migration, and the Nation-State. *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power*, vol. 7, no 4, pp. 539–582.
- Friedman J. (2007) *The Anthropology of Global Systems: Modernities, Class and the Contradictions of Globalization*, Walnut Creek: Altamira Press.
- GFK Ukraine (2008) *The Contribution of Human Resources Development to Migration Policy in Ukraine*, Kyiv: GFK Ukraine.

- Gherghel A., Le Gall J. (2005) Transnational Practices of Care: The Azorean Migration in Quebec (Canada). Available at: <http://www.inter-disciplinary.net/wp-content/uploads/2009/10/Gheghel-paper.pdf> (accessed 9 February 2010).
- Glick Schiller L., Basch C., Blanc-Szanton N. (1992) *Towards a Transnational Perspective on Migration: Race, Class, Ethnicity, and Nationalism Reconsidered*, New York: Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences.
- Glick Schiller N. (2013) The Transnational Migration Paradigm: Global Perspectives on Migrant Research. *Migration and Organized Civil Society* (eds. D. Halm, Z. Sezgin), New York: Routledge, pp. 25–43.
- Glushhenko G. (2005) Transnacionalizm migrantov i perspektivy global'nogo razvitija [Transnationalism of Migrants and Perspectives of Global Development]. *Mirovaja jekonomika i mezhdunarodnye otnoshenija*, no 12, pp. 50–57.
- Golod S. I. (2008) Sociologo-demograficheskiy analiz sostojanija i jevoljucii sem'i [Sociological Demographic Analysis of the Condition and Evolution of the Family]. *Sociologicheskie issledovanija*, vol. 7, no 1, pp. 40–49.
- Gregoriou Z. (2008) *Gendering Migration and Integration Policy Frames: Female Migrant Domestic Workers as "Precarious Workers" and as "Reconciliators"*. *Integration of Female Migrant Domestic Workers: Strategies for Employment and Civic Participation*, Nicosia: University of Nicosia Press, MIGS.
- Hamann S. (2007) Eastern Europe Is Running Out of Women. *Magazine for Arts and Civil Society in Central and Eastern Europe*, no 1. P. 8–12.
- Hannam K., Sheller M., Urry J. (2006) Editorial: Mobilities, Immobilities and Moorings. *Mobilities*, vol. 1, no 1, pp. 1–22.
- Hanson S. (2010) Gender and Mobility: New Approaches for Informing Sustainability. *Gender, Place and Culture*, vol. 17, no 1, pp. 5–23.
- Himmelweit S. (1999) Caring Labor. *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, no 561, pp. 27–38.
- Himmelweit S. (2002) Economic Theory, Norms and the Care Gap. *Analysing Families: Morality and Rationalities in Policy and Practice* (eds. A. Carling, S. Duncan, R. Edwards), London: Routledge, pp. 231–249.
- Hochschild A.R. (1997) *The Time Bind: When Work Becomes Home and Home Becomes Work*, New York: Metropolitan, Holt.
- Hochschild A.R. (2000) Global Care Chains and Emotional Surplus. *On the Edge: Living with Global Capitalism* (eds. W. Hutton, A. Giddens), London: Jonathan Cape, pp. 130–146.
- Hondagneu-Sotelo P. (2001) *Domestica: Immigrant Workers Cleaning and Caring in the Shadows of Affluence*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Hondagneu-Sotelo P., Avila E. (1997) "I'm Here, but I'm There": The Meaning of Latina Transnational Motherhood. *Gender and Society*, vol. 11, no 5, pp. 548–571.
- ILO (2013) *Domestic Workers Across the World: Global and Regional Statistics and the Extent of Legal Protection*, Geneva: International Labour Office.
- Ivaschenko-Stadnik E. (2013) *Vechnoe vozvrashhenie: sovremennye problemy social'noj reintegracii ukrainskih trudovyh migrantov, pribyvajushhih iz ES v Ukrainu (po rezul'tatam sociologicheskikh issledovanij)* [Eternal Return: Present-day Problems Associated with Social Reintegration of Ukrainian Labor Migrants Arriving in Ukraine from the EU (Based on Sociological Research Results)]. CARIM-East RR 2013/05, Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, San Domenico di Fiesole (FI): European University Institute.

- Jolly S., Reeves H. (2005) *Gender and Migration*. Overview report, Brighton: BRIDGE Institute of Development Studies.
- Kajzer M., Brednikova O. (2004) Transnacionalizm i translokal'nost' (komentarii k terminologiji) [Transnationalism and Translocality (Comments on Terminology)]. *Migracija i nacional'noe gosudarstvo* [Migration and Nation-State] (eds. T. Baraulin, O. Karpenko), Saint-Petersburg: CISR, pp. 133–146.
- Kambouri N., Zavos A. (2011) *Gender, Migration and Intercultural Interactions in the Mediterranean and South East Europe*. Final Synthesis Report, Ge.M.IC. Panteion University (UPSPS), Greece.
- Karpov J., Kapustina E. (2011) *Gorcy posle gor. Migracionnye processy v Dagestane v XX — nachale XXI veka: ih social'nye i jetnokul'turnye posledstvija i perspektivy* [Mountaineers after Mountains. Migrational Processes in Dagestan at 20th — Beginning of 21st Centuries: Their Social and Ethnocultural Implications and Perspectives], Saint-Petersburg: Peterburgskoe Vostokovedenie.
- Kasymova S. (2010) Rasshirjaja granicy: mezhjetnicheskie i mezhhkonal'nye braki v postsovetskom Tadžikistane (na primere brakov tadzhikskih zhenshin s inostrancami) [Expanding Ethnic and Confessional Boundaries: Marriages between Tajik Women and Foreign Men]. *Laboratorium*, no 3, pp. 126–149.
- Kelly P., Lusic T. (2006) Migration and the Transnational Habitus: Evidence from Canada and the Philippines. *Environment and Planning A*, vol. 38, no 5, pp. 831–884.
- KISA (2007) *KISA's contribution to Cyprus' report on the Resolution of the General Assembly of the United Nations 60/139 on "Violence Against Women Migrant Workers"*, KISA Action for Equality, Support, Antiracism.
- Klecina A. (1996) Sociologija sem'i [Sociology of Family]. *Sociologija v Rossii* [Sociology in Russia] (ed. V. Jadov), Moscow: Na Vorob'evykh gorah, Institut sociologii RAN, pp. 147–168.
- Kosmarskaja N. (1998) "Zhenskoe izmerenie" vyzhdennoj migracii i migracionnoe zakonodatel'stvo Rossii ["Female Dimension" of Forced Migration and Russian Migration Law], Moscow: MCGI, Proekt gendernaja jekspertiza.
- Kosmarskaja N. (2005) Ot sostavitelja [Editorial]. *Diaspory*, no 1, pp. 6–18.
- Kubal A., Bakewell O., De Haas H. (2011) *Theorizing the Evolution of European Migration Systems (THEMIS). The Evolution of Ukrainian Migration to the UK*. Scoping Study Report, International Migration Institute, University of Oxford.
- La Strada-Ukraine (2010) *Zhinki ta migracija* [Women and Migration], Harkiv: Prava ljudini.
- Layosa L. (1995) Economy Menders. *Tinig Filipino*, June 7, p. 7.
- Levitt P., Glick Schiller N. (2007) Conceptualizing Simultaneity: A Transnational Social Field Perspective on Society. *Rethinking Migration: New Theoretical and Empirical Perspectives* (eds. A. Portes, J. DeWind), New York, Oxford: Berghahn Books, pp. 181–218.
- Levitt P., Sorensen N.N. (2004) *The Transnational Turn in Migration Studies*, Geneva: Global Commission on International Migration.
- Libanova E. (ed.) (2010) *Molod' ta molodizhna politika v Ukraini: social'no-demografichni aspekti* [Youth and Youth Policy in Ukraine: Social and Demographic Aspects], Kyiv: Ptoukha Institute for Demography and Social Studies of the NAS of Ukraine.
- Libanova E., Poznjak O. (eds.) (2002) *Zovnishni trudovi migracii naseleennja Ukraini* [Outward Labour Migrations of Ukraine's Population], Kyiv: RVPS Ukraini.
- Lutz H. (2004) Migration, Transnationality, Gender in the Private Household. *Journal of Contemporary European Studies*, vol. 12, no 1, pp. 47–55.

- Lutz H. (2005) *When Homes Become a Workplace: Domestic Work as an Ordinary Job?* Paper presented at "Migration and Domestic Work in Global Perspective", Wassenaar, Netherlands, 26–29 May, 2005.
- Lutz H. (2008) Introduction: Migrant Domestic Workers in Europe. *Migration and Domestic Work* (ed. H. Lutz), Aldershot: Ashgate, pp. 1–10.
- Mandel J. (2004) Mobility Matters: Women's Livelihood Strategies in Porto Novo, Benin. *Gender, Place and Culture*, vol. 11, no 2, pp. 257–287.
- Manderscheid K., Endres M., Mincke Ch. (2013) *Discourses and Ideologies of Mobility* (forthcoming).
- Merla L., Baldassar L. (2010) Les dynamiques de soin transnationales: entre emotions et considerations economiques. *Recherches sociologiques et anthropologiques*, vol. 41, no 1, pp. 1–10.
- Mescherkina E. (1999) Biografii "novyh russkih": gendernaja legitimacija predprinimatel'stva v postsovet'skom prostranstve [Biographies of "New Russians": Gender Legitimation of Entrepreneurship in the Post-Soviet Space]. *Gendernye issledovanija*, no 2, pp. 123–144.
- Morawska E. (2005) The Sociology and History of Immigration: Reflections of a Practitioner. *International Migration Research: Constructions, Omissions, and the Promises of Interdisciplinarity* (ed. M. Bommers, E. Morawska), Aldershot: Ashgate, pp. 203–239.
- Morokvasic M. (2003) Transnational Mobility and Gender: A View from Post-Wall Europe. *Crossing Borders and Shifting Boundaries, Vol. 1: Gender on the Move* (eds. M. Morokvasic-Muller, U. Erel, K. Shinozaki), Opladen: Leske and Budrich, pp. 101–133.
- Morokvasic M. (2004) Settled in Mobility: Engendering Post-Wall Migration in Europe. *Feminist Review*, vol. 77, no 1, pp. 7–25.
- Morokvasic M. (2008) *Crossing Borders and Shifting Boundaries of Belonging in Post-Wall Europe: A Gender Lens*. Available at: <http://www.migrationonline.cz/themes/gender/> (accessed 15 April 2012).
- Mummert G. (2005) *Transnational Parenting in Mexican Migrants Communities: Redefining Fatherhood, Motherhood and Caregiving*. Paper presented at "The Mexican International Family Strengths", Cuernavaca, Mexico, 1–3 June, 2012.
- Nikolaevskij V. (2007) Intelektual'na migracija ta social'na bezpeka [Intellectual Migration and Social Security]. *Migracija ta tolerantnist' v Ukraïni* [Migration and Tolerance in Ukraine] (ed. Y. Pylynskyi), Kyiv: Stilos, pp. 121–126.
- Nesteruk O., Marks L.D. (2009) Grandparents Across the Ocean: Eastern European Immigrants' Struggle to Maintain Intergenerational Relationships. *Journal of Comparative Family Studies*, vol. 40, no 1, pp. 77–95.
- Oishi N. (2002) *Gender and Migration: An Integrative Approach*. Working paper 49, University of California, San Diego.
- Olimova S. (2012) Tadjikistan: rol' i status zhenshin v domohozjajstvah migrantov [Tajikistan: Women's Role and Status in Migrants' Households]. *Diaspora*, no 2, pp. 86–123.
- Orozko M., Lowell B. L., Bump M., Fedewa R. (2005) *Transnational Engagement, Remittances and Their Relation to Development in Latin America and the Caribbean*. Final report, Institute for the Study of International Migration, Georgetown University.
- Parrenas R.S. (2001) *Servants of Globalization: Women, Migration, and Domestic Work*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.

- Parrenas R.S. (2005) Long Distance Intimacy: Class, Gender and Intergenerational Relations Between Mothers and Children in Filipino Transnational Families. *Global Networks*, vol. 5, no 4, pp. 317–336.
- Pe Leah M. (2008) *Vlijanie migracii na gendernye roli v Moldove* [The Impact of Migration on Gender Roles in Moldova]. Available at: <http://europeandcis.undp.org/data/show/6E3B57C2-F203-1EE9-B32C463C923F7FDD> (accessed 11 January 2008).
- Petrozziello A.J. (2011) Feminised Financial Flows: How Gender Affects Remittances in Honduran—US Transnational Families. *Gender and Development*, vol. 19, no 1, pp. 53–67.
- Phizacklea A. (2003) Gender Actors in Migration. *Gender and Ethnicity in Contemporary Europe* (ed. J. Andal), Oxford: Berg, pp. 23–40.
- Poletaev D. (2005) Zhenshhiny-migranty iz zarubezhnyh stran v Rossii [Female Migrants from Foreign Countries in Russia]. *Demoscope Weekly*, no 221-222. Available at: <http://demoscope.ru/weekly/2005/0221/analito3.php> (accessed 11 October 2008).
- Ponomareva O. (2011) Novitni formi ukraïns'koï zhertovnosti [New Forms of Ukrainian Sacrifice]. *Ukrainske slovo* (electronic newsletter), 23 December 2011. Available at: <http://ukrslovo.org.ua/ukrayina/suspilstvo/novitni-formy-ukrayinskoyi-zhertovnosti.html> (accessed 23 March 2013).
- Portes A., Bach R. (1985) *Latin Journey: Cuban and Mexican Immigrants in the United States*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Portes A., Guarnizo L.E., Landolt P. (1999) The Study of Transnationalism: Pitfalls and Promise of an Emergent Research Field. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, vol. 22, no 2, pp. 217–237.
- Pries L. (1996) Transnationale Soziale Raume: theoretisch-empirische Skizze am Beispiel Mexiko—USA. *Zeitschrift fur Soziologie*, vol. 25, no 6, pp. 456–472.
- Sassen S. (2005) *Strategic Instantiations of Gendering: Global Cities and Global Survival Circuits*. Paper presented at the International Forum on Remittances, Washington, 20 June 2005.
- Schimanski J. (2010) Reading Gender in Border-Crossing Narratives. *Gendering Border Studies* (eds. J. Aaron, H. Altink, C. Weedon), Cardiff: University of Wales Press, pp. 105–126.
- Schmalzbauer L. (2004) Searching for Wages and Mothering from Afar: The Case of Honduran Transnational Families. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, vol. 66, no 5, pp. 1317–1331.
- SCNR (2010) *Informacijno-analitychni materialy z migracijnoi sytuacii v Ukraini u 2009 roci* [Informational-Analytical Materials on the Migratory Situation in Ukraine for 2009]. State Committee of Ukraine for Nationalities and Religion. April, 1, 2010. Available at: http://www.scnm.gov.ua/control/uk/publish/article?art_id=47631&cat_id=47924 (accessed 20 November 2010).
- Sheller M., Urry J. (2006) The New Mobilities Paradigm. *Environment and Planning A*, vol. 38, no 2, pp. 281–299.
- Sorensen N.N. (2005) *Transnational Family Life Across the Atlantic: The Experience of Colombian and Dominican Migrants in Europe*. Paper presented at “Migration and Domestic Work in a Global Perspective”, Wassenaar, Netherlands, 26–29 May 2005.
- Thadani V.N., Todaro M.P. (1984) Female Migration: A Conceptual Framework. *Women in the Cities of Asia: Migration and Urban Adaptation* (eds. J.T. Fawcett, S.-E. Khoo, P.C. Smith), Boulder: Westview Press, pp. 36–59.

- Tiaynen T. (2011) *Transnational Babushkas: Grandmothers? Changing Lives Across Russian—Finnish Border*. Paper presented at the 10th Conference of the European Sociological Association “Social Relations in Turbulent Times”, Geneva, 7–10 September 2011.
- Tolstokorova A. (2008) Locally Neglected, Globally Engaged: Ukrainian Women on the Move. *Technologies of Globalization: International Conference Proceedings* (eds. R. Anderl, B. Arich-Gerz, R. Schmiede), Darmstadt: Technical University Darmstadt, pp. 44–61.
- Tolstokorova A. (2009) Who Cares for Carers? Feminization of Labor Migration from Ukraine and Its Impact on Social Welfare. *International Issues and Slovak Foreign Policy Affairs*, vol. 8, no 1, pp. 62–84.
- Tolstokorova A. (2009) *Multiple Marginalities: Gender Dimension of Rural Poverty, Unemployment and Labour Migration in Ukraine*. Paper presented at FAO-IFAD-ILO Workshop “Gaps, Trends and Current Research in Gender Dimensions of Agricultural and Rural Employment: Differentiated Pathways Out of Poverty”, Rome, 31 March — 2 April 2009.
- Tolstokorova A. (2010) Bitter Berries of Better Life: Socio-demographic Costs of Labour Migration for the Ukrainian Society. *ENQUIRE* (online journal), no 5, pp. 68–94.
- Tolstokorova A. (2011) *Virtual Daddies, Mommies and Grannies: Ukrainian Transnational Parenthood and Grandparenthood in Gender Perspective*. Paper presented at IDEA Conference “Gender Justice and Development: Local and Global”, Bryn Mawr College, USA, 9–11 June 2011.
- Tolstokorova A. (2012) Of Women’s Bondage: Socio-economic Effects of Labour Migration on the Situation of Ukrainian Women and Family. *Acta Universitatis Sapientiae*, vol. 2, no 1, pp. 9–29.
- Tolstokorova A. (2012) “Mama moet ramu v Rime”: Gendernye aspekty transnacional'nogo roditel'stva v Ukraine [“Mommy Washes Windows in Rome”: Gender Aspects of Transnational Parenthood in Ukraine]. *Zhurnal issledovaniy social'noj politiki*, vol. 10, no 3, pp. 396–408.
- Tolstokorova A. (2012) Geroini nashego vremeni: zhenskaja trudovaja migracija iz Ukrainy [Heroin of Our Time: Womens’ Labour Migration from Ukraine]. *Diaspory*, no 1, pp. 198–226.
- Tolstokorova A. (2012) “Zhdi i pomni menja!”: Ukrainskaja transnacional'naja sem'ja kak ob'ekt gendernogo analiza [“Wait and Remember Me!” Ukrainian Transnational Family as an Object of Gender Analysis]. *Diaspory*, no 2, pp. 25–60.
- Tolstokorova A. (2013) Transnacional'naja sem'ja kak modernizirovannaja model' semejnyh otnoshenij: panaceja, jad ili placebo? [Ukrainian Transnational Family as a Modernized Model of Family Relationship: Panacea, Poison or Placebo?] *Sociologicheskij zhurnal*, no 2, pp. 40–62.
- Tolstokorova A. (2013) Unesennye vetrom. Postsovetskoe pokolenie ukrainских zhenshhin-migrantok [“Gone With the Wind”: The Post-Soviet Generation of Ukrainian Mi- grant Women]. *Labirint*, no 2, pp. 28–44.
- Tolstokorova A. (2013) Luchi sveta v temnom carstve: social'nye dividendy migrantov v gendernoj perspektive [Rays of Light in Darken Kingdom: Social Dividends of Migrants in Gendered Perspective]. *Jetnograficheskoe obozrenie*, no 5. (In press)
- TRCE (2002) *Trudova migracija naseleennja Ternopil'skoï oblasti: kil'kisni ta geografichni aspekti* [Labour Migration of the Ternopil Region Population: Quantitative and Geographical Aspects], Ternopil: Lider.

- Tyuryukanova E. (ed.) (2011) *Zhenshhiny-migranty iz stran SNG v Rossii* [Female Migrants from CIS Countries in Russia], Moscow: Maks Press.
- UN-INSTRAW (2007) *Feminization of Migration*. Working Paper 1. Santo Domingo.
- UN (2006) *World Survey on the Role of Women in Development: Women and International Migration*, New York: United Nations Organization.
- UNIFEM (2006) *The Story Behind the Numbers: Women and Employment in Central and Eastern Europe and the Western Commonwealth of Independent States*. Available at: <http://www.refworld.org/docid/46cadad40.html> (accessed 10 June 2012).
- Urry J. (2000) *Sociology Beyond Societies: Mobilities for the Twenty-First Century*, London: Sage.
- Valentine G. (1989) The Geography of Women's Fear. *Area*, vol. 21, no 4, pp. 385–390.
- Vertovec S. (2001) Transnationalism and Identity. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, vol. 27, no 4, pp. 573–582.
- Veselkova N. (1994) Poluformalizovannoe interv'ju [Semi-formalized Interview]. *Sociologicheskij zhurnal*, no 3, pp. 103–109.
- Veselkova N. (2011) Novye issledovaniya mobil'nosti: sovpadajushhie i nesovpadajushhie potoki i social'naja kompetentnost' [New Studies of Mobility: Congruent and Non-congruent Flows and Social Competence]. *Zhurnal sociologii i social'noj antropologii*, vol. 14, no 3, pp. 50–66.
- Vuorela U. (2002) Transnational Families: Imagined and Real Communities. *The Transnational Family: New European Frontiers and Global Networks* (eds. D. Bryceston, U. Vuorella), New York, Oxford: Berg, pp. 63–82.
- Widmer E. (2010) *Family Configurations: A Structural Approach to Family Diversity*, Farnham: Ashgate.
- Zaporozhets O. (2012) Ot manifesta k tekstu [From Manifest to Text]. *Sociologicheskoe obozrenie*, vol. 11, no 3, pp. 164–168.
- Zlotnik H. (1998) International Migration 1965–1996: An Overview. *Population and Development Review*, vol. 24, no 3, pp. 429–468.

Collective and Individual in Durkheim's Philosophical Anthropology

Greg Yudin

Senior Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000
E-mail: gregloko@yandex.ru

The paper focuses on Emile Durkheim's philosophical-anthropological views, particularly on the structure of his argument in "The Dualism of Human Nature and Its Social Conditions", and traces the development on his views on the relationship between the individual and the collective with respect to the problem of human nature. Despite Durkheim's open despise for metaphysical theories of human nature, his sociological project clearly contains philosophical-anthropological content. It was Durkheim's intention to provide firm scientific sociological grounds for the dualistic conception of man. In his early oeuvre, Durkheim aims to explain the relation between the collective and the individual in human with his theory of solidarity. Unlike Ferdinand Toennies, Durkheim holds that their social evolution does not essentially change its substratum, since conditions of solidarity are the same for all societies whether they are based on mechanical or organic solidarity. However, the conception of organic solidarity contains several fundamental contradictions that make it unable to play the political role that Durkheim assigned to it and also drew extensive criticism in sociological theory. Eventually, Durkheim abandons this solution and his late work puts the experience of communion at the center of any collective life and describes the internal dynamics of this experience that fluctuates along with an unstable relationship between the collective and the individual within human being. Durkheim's anthropology can be regarded as a call for science that would be capable of developing the viewpoint suitable for analyzing this changing relationship, and this paper questions the potential of Durkheimian sociological project in fulfilling this task.

Keywords: Durkheim, sacred, profane, collective, individual, communion, solidarity

References

- Alexander J. (ed.) (1988) *Durkheimian Sociology and Cultural Studies*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Alexander J. (1988) Introduction: Durkheimian Sociology and Cultural Studies Today. *Durkheimian Sociology and Cultural Studies* (ed. J. Alexander), Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 1–21.
- Allen N.J., Pickering W.S.F., Miller W.W. (eds.) (1998) *On Durkheim's "Elementary Forms of Religious Life"*, London: Routledge.
- Blais M.-C. (2008) La solidarite. *Le Telemaque*, no 1, pp. 9–24.
- Buffon G.-L. (1753) Discours sur la nature des animaux. *Histoire naturelle, generale et particuliere. Tome quatrieme*, Paris: Imprimerie Royale, pp. 1–168.
- Cladis M. (1992) Durkheim's Individual in Society: A Sacred Marriage? *Journal of the History of Ideas*, vol. 53, no 1, pp. 71–90.
- Durkheim E. (1897) *Le suicide: etude de sociologie*, Paris: Felix Alcan.
- Durkheim E. (1966) *Rousseau et Montesquieu, precurseurs de la sociologie*, Paris: Librairie Marcel Riviere et Cie.
- Durkheim E. (1975) Communauté et société selon Toennies. *Textes. 1: Elements d'une théorie sociale*, Paris: Minuit, pp. 383–390.

- Durkheim E. (1975) Le probleme religieux et la dualite de la nature humaine. *Textes. 2: Religion, morale, anomie*, Paris: Minuit, pp. 23–59.
- Durkheim E. (1990) *Les forms elementaires de la vie religieuse: Le systeme totemique en Australie*, Paris: Quadrige, PUF.
- Durkheim E. (1991) O razdelenii obshhestvennogo truda [On the Division of Labour in Society]. *O razdelenii obshhestvennogo truda. Metod sociologii* [On the Division of Labour in Society. Sociological Method], Moscow: Nauka, pp. 3–390.
- Durkheim E. (1991) Metod sociologii [Sociological Method]. *O razdelenii obshhestvennogo truda. Metod sociologii* [On the Division of Labour in Society. Sociological Method], Moscow: Nauka, pp. 391–532.
- Durkheim E. (1998) Jelementarnye formy religioznoj zhizni. Totemicheskaja sistema v Avstralii (Vvedenie i pervaja glava) [The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life. Totemic System in Australia (Introduction and First Chapter)]. *Mistika. Religija. Nauka. Klassiki mirovogo religiovedenija* [Mistics. Science. Religion: Classics of the World Religious Studies] (ed. A. Krasnikov), Moscow: Kanon+, pp. 174–230.
- Eulriet I., Miller W.W. (2005) “The Dualism of Human Nature”: Translators’ Note. *Durkheimian Studies*, vol. 11, pp. 33–34.
- Fellows O. (1970) *From Voltaire to La Nouvelle Critique: Problems and Personalities*, Geneve: Droz.
- Fish J. (2013) Homo Duplex Revisited: A Defence of Emile Durkheim’s Theory of the Moral Self. *Journal of Classical Sociology*, vol. 13, no 3, pp. 338–358.
- Gofman A. (1975) Religija v filozofsko-sociologicheskoj koncepcii E. Durkheim [Religion in E. Durkheim’s Philosophical-Sociological Conception]. *Sociologicheskie issledovanija*, no 4, pp. 178–187.
- Gofman A. (2013) Solidarnost’ ili pravila, Durkheim ili Hayek? O dvuh formah social’noj integracii [Solidarity or Rules, Durkheim or Hayek? On Two Forms of Social Integration]. *Sociologicheskij ezhegodnik 2012* [Sociological Yearbook 2012] (eds. N. Pokrovsky, D. Efremenko), Moscow: INION RAN, HSE, pp. 97–167.
- Hawkins M.J. (1977) A Re-examination of Durkheim’s Theory of Human Nature. *Sociological Review*, vol. 25, no 2, pp. 229–251.
- Hynes E. (1975) Suicide and Homo Duplex: An Interpretation of Durkheim’s Typology of Suicide. *Sociological Quarterly*, vol. 16, no 1, pp. 87–104.
- Judin G. (2009) Smysl samoubijstva [The Meaning of Suicide]. *Sociologicheskoe obozrenie*, vol. 8, no 2, pp. 80–93.
- Kurakin D. (2011) Uskol’zajushhee sakral’noe: problema ambivalentnosti sakral’nogo i ee znachenie dlja “sil’noj programmy” kul’tursociologii [Eluding Sacred: Ambiguity of the Sacred and Its Importance for the “Strong Program” in Cultural Sociology]. *Sociologicheskoe obozrenie*, vol. 10, no 3, pp. 41–70.
- Miller W.W. (2010) Rethinking “The Dualism of Human Nature”. *Durkheimian Studies*, vol. 16, pp. 137–144.
- Parsons T. (1966) *The Structure of Social Action*, New York: The Free Press.
- Pope W., Johnson B. (1983) Inside Organic Solidarity. *American Sociological Review*, vol. 48, no 5, pp. 681–692.
- Robertson Smith W. (1889) *Lectures on the Religion of the Semites. First Series: The Fundamental Institutions* New York: D. Appleton & Co.
- Shilling C., Mellor P. (1998) Durkheim, Morality and Modernity: Collective Effervescence, Homo Duplex and the Sources of Moral Action. *British Journal of Sociology*, vol. 49, no 2, pp. 193–209.
- Zenkin S. (2012) *Nebozhestvennoe sakral’noe* [The Non-Divine Sacred], Moscow: RGGU.

The Dualism of Human Nature and Its Social Conditions

Emile Durkheim

Greg Yudin
(translator)

Senior Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000
E-mail: gregloko@yandex.ru

This paper briefly summarizes Durkheim's theory of the dual nature of man suggested earlier in his *Elementary Forms of Religious Life*. It is characteristic of human beings that two opposite principles confront each other within them: soul and body, concept and sensation, moral activity and sensory appetites. Although this inherent inconsistency of man has been long recognized by philosophical thought, no doctrine explanation to it has been provided to date. While empiricist monism has proved to be unable to explain how concepts emerge from sensations and disinterestedness develops from self-interest, absolute idealism, on the contrary, cannot deduce sensations from concepts. Although theories suggested by Plato and Kant do not bypass the problem of dualism, they only rephrase it and make no progress in solving it. According to Durkheim, dualism of human nature stems from the fact that all religions are founded on dividing all things into the sacred and the profane. This division, in turn, is explained by coexistence of collective and individual origins in the human being. Sacred things arise out of the collective origin that enables individual consciousnesses to fuse into communion. Collective origin does not act with constant strength, but intensifies during the periods of effervescence, when it subdues the individual origin. Since the importance of the social aspect of man increases over time, there is no reason to believe that complete consent between individual and society is possible that would endow man with internal harmony.

Keywords: human nature, sacred, profane, collective, individual, religion, moral

Plagiarism and the Constitutive Order of Dissertation Text

Andrei Korbut

Research Fellow, National Research University Higher School of Economics
20 Myasnitskaya Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 101000
E-mail: korbut.andrei@gmail.com

The paper considers a problem of plagiarism in dissertation text. Using a particular case — the dissertation in religious studies, that contains a big portions of the borrowed text — it is shown that analysis of plagiarism will be deficient without understanding of the mechanisms of local textual order production. This constitutive order of dissertation text presupposes a particular ways of text's organization with respect to by whom, under what circumstances, and in which ways it will be read. The possibility of the successful defense of the dissertation containing plagiarism is connected not so much to the properties of the social context of dissertation text, as to the practices of competent reading that underlie scientific expertise. It is demonstrated that dissertation's author faces a number of contradictory requirements: firstly, he/she has to provide an original text, that simultaneously satisfies some formal requirements; secondly, he/she has to show his/her individual scientific contribution, indicating, at the same time, how it is connected to the previous studies; and thirdly, he/she has to display his/her knowledge of specific area and literature that nobody knows as good as him/her, but his/her text must, at the same time, make it possible to be evaluated by the competent colleagues. To reconcile these requirements, author creates text which should be credible, but which thereby opens a room for plagiarism. Plagiarism in dissertation text, in this case, can be understood as a way of using a number of constitutive expectancies underlying scientific communication and distribution of scientific knowledge.

Keywords: plagiarism, dissertation, scientific texts, expertise, practices of reading, sociology of science

References

- Anderson D.C. (1978) Some Organizational Features in the Local Production of a Plausible Text. *Philosophy of the Social Sciences*, vol. 8, no 2, pp. 113–135.
- Blum S.D. (2009) *My Word! Plagiarism and College Culture*, Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Carlin A.P. (2002) Bibliographic Boundaries and Forgotten Canons. *Cultural Studies: Interdisciplinarity and Translation* (ed. S. Herbrechter), Amsterdam: Rodopi, pp. 113–130.
- Carlin A.P. (2004) On “Owning” Silence: Talk, Texts and the “Semiotics” of Bibliographies. *Semiotica*, vol. 146, no 1-4, pp. 117–138.
- Carlin A.P. (2007) Auspices of Corpus Status: Bibliography* as a Phenomenon of Respecification. *Orders of Ordinary Action: Respecifying Sociological Knowledge* (ed. S. Hester, D. Francis), Aldershot: Ashgate, pp. 91–103.
- Carlin A.P. (2009) The Temporal Organization of Bibliographies. *Library Quarterly*, vol. 79, no 2, pp. 161–173.
- Garfinkel H. (1967) *Studies in Ethnomethodology*, Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall.
- Introna L.D., Hayes N. (2011) On Sociomaterial Imbrications: What Plagiarism Detection Systems Reveal and Why It Matters. *Information and Organization*, vol. 21, no 2, pp. 107–122.
- Knorr-Cetina K. (1981) *The Manufacture of Knowledge: An Essay on the Constructivist and Contextual Nature of Science*, New York: Pergamon.

- Latour B., Woolgar S. (1986) *Laboratory Life: The Construction of Scientific Facts*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Livingston E. (1995) *An Anthropology of Reading*, Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Lynch M., Bogen D. (1997) Sociology's Asociological "Core": An Examination of Textbook Sociology in Light of the Sociology of Scientific Knowledge. *American Sociological Review*, vol. 62, no 3, pp. 481–493.
- Merton R.K. (1973) *The Sociology of Science: Theoretical and Empirical Investigations*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Merton R.K. (1995) The Thomas Theorem and the Matthew Effect. *Social Forces*, vol. 74, no 2, pp. 379–422.
- Morrison K. (1981) Some Properties of "Telling Order Designs" in Didactic Inquiry. *Philosophy of the Social Sciences*, vol. 11, no 2, pp. 245–262.
- Morrison K. (1989) Some Researchable Recurrences in Disciplinary-Specific Inquiry. *The Interactional Order: New Directions in the Study of Social Order* (eds. D.T. Helm, W.T. Anderson, A.J. Meehan, A.W. Rawls), New York: Irvington Publishers, pp. 141–158.
- O'Neill J. (1981) The Literary Production of Natural and Social Science Inquiry: Issues and Applications in the Social Organization of Science. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, vol. 6, no 2, pp. 105–120.
- Sacks H. (1975) Everyone Has to Lie. *Sociocultural Dimensions of Language Use* (eds. M. Sanches, B.G. Blount), New York: Academic Press, pp. 57–80.
- Sacks H. (1995) *Lectures on Conversation*, Oxford: Blackwell.
- Sacks H. (2006) Sociologicheskoe opisaniye [Sociological Description]. *Sociologicheskoe obozrenie*, vol. 5, no 1, pp. 43–53.
- Safronov R. (2011) *Sovremennyye interpretacii sociologicheskoy koncepcii religii Jemilja Djurkgejma v anglojazychnoj religiovedcheskoj literature* [Contemporary Interpretations of Emil Durkheim's Conception of Religion in English-Language Literature on Religious Studies] (PhD Thesis), Moscow: St. Tikhon's Orthodox University.
- Sokolov M., Titaev K. (2013) *Provincial'naja i tuzemnaja nauka* [Provincial and Indigenous Science] (unpublished paper). Available at: http://anthropologie.kunstkamera.ru/files/pdf/editing/sokolov_titaev4.doc (accessed 28 May 2013).
- Schutz A. (2004) Horosho informirovannyj grazhdanin: ocherk o social'nom raspredelenii znaniya [The Well-Informed Citizen: An Essay on the Social Distribution of Knowledge]. *Izbrannoe: Mir, svetjashhijsja smyslom* [Collected Papers: A World Shining with a Sense], Moscow: ROSSPEN, pp. 557–572.
- Sharrock W., Ikeya N. (2000) Instructional Matter: Readable Properties of an Introductory Text in Matrix Algebra. *Local Educational Order: Ethnomethodological Studies of Knowledge in Action* (eds. S. Hester, D. Francis), Amsterdam: John Benjamins, pp. 271–288.
- Watson R. (2009) *Analysing Practical and Professional Texts: A Naturalistic Approach*, Farnham: Ashgate.

The Ambivalent Commonality

Nina Sosna

Senior Research Fellow, Institute of Philosophy of the Russian Academy of Sciences

14 Volkhonka Str., Moscow, Russian Federation 119991

Email: phljrn1@yandex.ru

Review of *Grammatika mnozhestva: k analizu form sovremennoj zhizni* [A Grammar of the Multitude: For an Analysis of Contemporary Forms of Life] by Paolo Virno (Moscow: Ad Marginem, 2013).

Contents

POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY	
Political Heterogeneity and “Constitutio Libertatis”.....	3
<i>Alexey Glukhov</i>	
Two Concepts of Rules.....	16
<i>John Rawls</i>	
Toward a Historical Situation of Police in Russia.....	41
<i>Александр Филиппов</i>	
A Dialogue of Oleg Kildyushov and Zinaida Peregudova.....	43
<i>Oleg Kildyushov, Zinaida Peregudova, Olga Kononova</i>	
SCHMITTIANA	
Glossarium.....	55
<i>Carl Schmitt</i>	
RUSSIAN ATLANTIS	
The “Ladies’ Circle” of Slavophilism: The Letters of I.S. Aksakov to Countess M.F. Sollogub, 1862–1878.....	66
<i>Andrey Teslya</i>	
REVIEW ESSAYS	
Transnational and Gender Paradigms in the Study of International Mobility: The Case of Ukraine.....	98
<i>Alisa Tolstokorova</i>	
TRANSLATIONS	
Collective and Individual in Durkheim’s Philosophical Anthropology.....	122
<i>Greg Yudin</i>	
The Dualism of Human Nature and Its Social Conditions.....	133
<i>Emile Durkheim</i>	
ACADEMIC LIFE	
Plagiarism and the Constitutive Order of Dissertation Text.....	145
<i>Andrei Korbut</i>	
BOOK REVIEW	
The Ambivalent Commonality.....	172
<i>Nina Sosna</i>	